## B4WARMED: Boreal Forest Warming at an Ecotone in Danger

B4WARMED stands for Boreal Forest Warming at an Ecotone in Danger.

The project is funded by the Department of Energy. Principal Investigators are Peter Reich (PI), Rebecca Montgomery, Sarah Hobbie, Jacek Oleksyn and Roy Rich (co-investigators). The research seeks to help answer the question, "How will Minnesota tree species respond to a warming climate?"

The global climate system is being altered by anthropogenic emissions of  $CO_2$  and other greenhouse gases, increasing temperatures worldwide, particularly at northern latitudes. The pace of global climate change, including warming, is expected to accelerate in the coming century, as atmospheric concentrations of greenhouse gases continue to increase. In Minnesota, our climate has migrated 70 miles north in the past 50 years, and may migrate 125-250 miles further north in the next 50 years.

Northern Minnesota is a focal point of potential climate warming impacts because it sits at the transition - or ecotone- between the boreal and temperate forest zones. Most tree species in these forests (like aspen, spruce, and birch) are common in the boreal forests to our north in Canada or in the temperate maple-oak forests common to Wisconsin and places south and east. Increasing oak-maple dominance in our forest communities under a warmer future would represent a shift from our boreal heritage. However, both the northern and temperate tree species may perform poorly under warmer conditions. If so, neither our current forest trees nor their potential replacements may be well suited to our future climate. This experiment will enable us to assess the potential for climate change to alter future forest composition by experimentally warming forest plots (with infrared lamps and soil heating cables). We are documenting the effects on establishment, growth, and survival of seedlings of ten important tree species near their warmer (boreal species: Pinus banksiana, Picea glauca, Abies balsamea, Populus tremuloides, Betula papyrifera) or colder (temperate species: Pinus strobus, Quercus macrocarpa, Quercus rubra, Acer rubrum, Acer saccharum) range limits in northern Minnesota, in order to understand how germination, growth and survival at the establishment stage are influenced by direct and indirect climate effects.



 $...60^{\circ}....55^{\circ}....50^{\circ}....45^{\circ}....40^{\circ}....35^{\circ}...$ 

Our central hypothesis is that warming treatments will enhance growth and survival of temperate species at the cold (northern) edge of their range but reduce growth and survival of boreal species at the warm (southern) edge of their range.

Research sites are located at the Cloquet Forestry Center, near Cloquet, MN and at the Hubachek Wilderness Research Center near Ely, MN.

To date, we have achieved temperature elevation near our targets. Warmed season means across 2009-2012 field seasons were +1.9C and +3.5C for soil temperature at 10 cm depth. Aboveground means were +1.6C and +3.3C from infrared radiometer measurements of canopy surface temperature.

In 2012, we installed and deployed event-based rain exclosures on 18 plots in the open canopy replicates of the warming experiment where we could safely and reliably remove rainfall without complications from tree damage to shelters and stem flow from large trees. Mean rainfall exclusion from June until September was approximately 42-45% at both sites.

Growth and survival patterns across the 2008-2012 have been consistent with hypotheses. Boreal species, especially conifers, tended to show negative responses to warming for survival and growth of juveniles whether from the planted seeding or planted seed cohorts (of different ages) or both. Balsam fir and white spruce tended to have the most negative responses. Temperate broadleave species (oak and maples) by contrast tended to have neutral or positive growth and survival responses. Such responses are consistent with in situ photosynthesis responses. Additionally, rising temperatures can affect plant performance indirectly by increasing nutrient availability in soil via accelerating microbial activities. Both shoot and root biomass were significantly increased in soils from the warmed soils; however, significant differences were mainly found between ambient and +3.4 °C temperature treatments. This is a clear indication that warming treatment modified soil processes in significant ways.

This research is supported by the Office of Science (BER), U.S. Department of Energy, Grant No. DE-FG02-07ER64456.

## **Publications:**

Jacques, M.-H., L. Lapointe, K. Rice, R.A. Montgomery, A. Stefanski & P.B. Reich. 2015. Responses of two understory herbs, *Maianthemum canadense* and *Eurybia macrophylla*, to experimental forest warming: Early emergence is the key to enhanced reproductive output. American J. Botany 102(10):1–15. http://www.amjbot.org/

Jamieson, M. A., E. G. Schwartzberg, K. F. Raffa, P. B. Reich, R. L. Lindroth. 2015. Experimental climate warming alters aspen and birch phytochemistry and performance traits for an outbreak insect herbivore. Global Change Biology DOI: 10.1111/gcb.12842

Reich, P.B., K.M. Sendall, K. Rice, R. L. Rich, A. Stefanski, S.E. Hobbie, R.A. Montgomery. 2015. Geographic range predicts photosynthetic and growth response to warming in co-occurring tree species. Nature Climate Change 5(2):148-152.

Rich, R. L., A. Stefanski, R. A. Montgomery, S. E. Hobbie, B.A. Kimball, P.B. Reich. 2015. Design and performance of combined infrared canopy and belowground warming in the B4WarmED (Boreal Forest Warming at an Ecotone in Danger) experiment. Global Change Biology DOI: 10.1111/gcb.12855

Sendall, K. M., P. B. Reich, C. Zhao, J. Hou, X. Wei, A. Stefanski, K. Rice, R. L. Rich, R. A. Montgomery. 2015. Acclimation of photosynthetic temperature optima of temperate and boreal tree species in response to experimental forest warming. Global Change Biology 21(3): 1342-1357.

Eisenhauer, N., A. Stefanski, N.A. Fisichelli, K. Rice, R. Rich, P.B. Reich. 2014. Warming shifts 'worming': effects of experimental warming on invasive earthworms in northern North America. Scientific Reports 4: 6890.

Schwartzberg, E.G., M.A. Jamieson, K.F. Raffa, P.B. Reich, R.A. Montgomery, R.L. Lindroth. 2014. Simulated climate warming alters phenological synchrony between an outbreak insect herbivore and host trees. Oecologia 175:1041-1049.

Thakur, MP, Reich PB, Eddy WC, Stefanski A, Rich R, Hobbie, SE; Eisenhauer, N. 2014. Some plants like it warmer: increased growth of three selected invasive plant species in soils with a history of experimental warming. Pedobiologia 57:57-60.

Thakur, M.P., P.B. Reich, N. Fisichelli, A. Stefanski, S. Cesarz, T. Dobies, R. Rich, S.E. Hobbie, N. Eisenhauer. 2014. Nematode community shifts in response to experimental warming and canopy conditions are associated with plant community changes in the temperate-boreal forest ecotone. *Oecologia*. 175:713-723.

Brzostek, ER, JM Blair, JS Dukes, SD Frey, SE Hobbie, JM Melillo, RJ Mitchell, E Pendall, PB Reich, GR Shaver, A Stefanski, MG Tjoelker, AC Finzi. 2012. The effect of experimental warming and precipitation change on proteolytic enzyme activity: positive feedbacks to nitrogen availability are not universal (.pdf) Global Change Biology 18:2617-2625.

Poorter, H, K Niklas, PB Reich, J Oleksyn, P Poot, L Mommer. 2012. Biomass allocation to leaves, stems and roots: meta-analyses of interspecific variation and environmental control. (.pdf) 2012. (Tansley Review) New Phytologist 193:30-50. doi:10.1111/j.1469-8137.2011.03952.x

## Posters:

Eddy III, W.C., S.E. Hobbie, A. Stefanski, K. Rice, R.L. Rich, P.B. Reich. 2013. B4WarmED forest warming experiment: Effects of soil moisture on soil organic matter decomposition. Ecological Society of America, Minneapolis, MN, Aug. 4-9, 2013.

Montgomery, R.A., P.B. Reich, A. Stefanski, R.L. Rich. 2013. B4WarmED forest warming experiment: Phenological responses of dominant tree species at the temperate-boreal ecotone. Ecological Society of America, Minneapolis, MN, Aug. 4-9, 2013.

Montgomery, R.A., R.L. Rich, A. Stefanski, K.E. Rice, S.E. Hobbie, P.B. Reich. 2013. B4WarmED forest warming experiment: Effects of warming on seedling growth of co-occurring temperate and boreal species. Ecological Society of America, Minneapolis, MN, Aug. 4-9, 2013.

Reich, P.B., R. L. Rich, A. Stefanski, K. Sendall, R.A. Montgomery, S.E. Hobbie, C.-M. Zhao, Karen Rice. 2013. B4WarmED forest warming experiment: Species geographic distributions predict photosynthetic responses of local ecotypes to climate warming. Ecological Society of America, Minneapolis, MN, Aug. 4-9, 2013.

Rice, K.E., R.A. Montgomery, R.L. Rich, N.A. Fisichelli, M.-H. Jacques, A. Stefanski, P.B. Reich. 2013. B4WarmED forest warming experiment: Increased temperature effects on herbaceous plant phenology. Ecological Society of America, Minneapolis, MN, Aug. 4-9, 2013.

Rich, R.L., A. Stefanski, R.A. Montgomery, S.E. Hobbie, P.B. Reich. 2013. B4WarmED forest warming experiment: Design and implementation of four years of concurrent above- and below-ground warming at the temperate-boreal ecotone. Ecological Society of America, Minneapolis, MN, Aug. 4-9, 2013.

Sendall, K.M., R.A. Montgomery, R.L. Rich, A. Stefanski, K. Rice, J. Hou, X. Wei, P. B. Reich. 2013. B4WarmED forest warming experiment: Effects on photosynthetic temperature optima of temperate and boreal tree species. Ecological Society of America, Minneapolis, MN, Aug 4-9, 2013.

Smith, D.P., P.B. Reich, S. E. Hobbie, A. Stefanski, K.G. Peay. 2013. B4WarmED forest warming experiment: Effects on diversity, community structure and function of soil fungi and bacteria. Ecological Society of America, Minneapolis, MN, Aug. 4-9, 2013.

Thakur, M.P., P.B. Reich, N. Fisichelli, A. Stefanski, S. Cesarz, T. Dobies, R. L. Rich, S. Hobbie, N. Eisenhauer. 2013. B4WarmED forest warming experiment: Shifts in nematode community influence plant cover and composition. Ecological Society of America, Minneapolis, MN, Aug. 4-9, 2013.

Department of Forest Resources | 115 Green Hall | 1530 Cleveland Ave. N St. Paul, MN 55108 | 612-624-3400

http://forestecology.cfans.umn.edu/research/climate-change/b4warmed